

Dissent and Heresy

Gordon Leff, "Heresy in the Middle Ages," *Dictionary of the History of Ideas* 2:416–24, and Ernest Tuveson, "Millenarianism," *Dictionary of the History of Ideas* 3:223–25, are relevant summaries with bibliographical suggestions. Two older works are still valuable for the beginner: A. S. Turberville, *Medieval Heresy and the Inquisition*, which devotes part 1 to a summary of the major heretical movements and part 2 to the development of inquisitorial principles and machinery, and H. C. Lea, *A History of the Inquisition of the Middle Ages* (3 vols.), which is a highly informative, anti-Catholic study now available for the student in an abridgment by M. Nicholson as *The Inquisition of the Middle Ages*. H. Grundmann, *Religiöse Bewegungen im Mittelalter*, cited above for its contributions to an understanding of the full context of medieval theology, is also a classic study of the heretical movements. The most valuable studies of medieval heresies for the English-speaking student are two recent works by Jeffrey B. Russell and Gordon Leff. Russell, *Dissent and Reform in the Early Middle Ages*, reviews the early dissent movements and subtly weighs the causes of the movements. In specific opposition to Norman Cohn, Russell argues that medieval dissent and heresy cannot be defined either in causes or goals as basically rooted in social movements. Leff also takes the same position in his *Heresy in the Later Middle Ages: The Relation of Heterodoxy to Dissent, c. 1250–1450* (2 vols.). Leff sees the emergence of heretical movements as part of the inner dynamic of Christianity, as one means of overcoming the tensions between the precepts and practice of the church. According to Leff, dissenting or heterodox movements within the church were the original form of the fully heretical movements that plagued the high and late Middle Ages. Leff pursues his study with reviews of the themes of poverty and prophecy, union with God, and the true church, concluding volume 2 with an excellent bibliography. On the last theme, i.e., the "true church" as a slogan of heretical movements, see Leff's "The Making of the Myths of a True Church in the Later Middle Ages" in *Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 1 (1971):1–15.

There are now two excellent collections of documents on medieval heresy: W. L. Wakefield and A. P. Evans, eds., *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, which has an introduction by W. L. Wakefield, and J. B. Russell, ed., *Religious Dissent in the Middle Ages*. Derek Baker, ed., *Schism, Heresy, and Religious Protest*, collects 30 articles by scholars on dissent from ancient to modern times.

Norman Cohn, *The Pursuit of the Millennium*, is a study chiefly of medieval and early modern apocalyptic movements among the poor.

The work is a mine of information on medieval religious thought and on the social and economic environment of radical religious thought. The present revised edition has reduced the original conclusion's argument that there was an internal historical link between these apocalyptic movements and modern fascism and communism. S. Runciman, *The Medieval Manichee: A Study of the Christian Dualist Heresy*, attempts to trace such heresies as the Albigensian back through eastern importations to the gnostic movements of the ancient world. The work is generally criticized for an exaggerated estimate of direct and indirect eastern influences and of the extent of dualism in western Europe, but it remains a standard work on medieval religion. M. Reeves, *The Influence of Prophecy in the Later Middle Ages: A Study in Joachimism*, surveys one of the most important medieval heresies—and one with long-lasting effects on orthodox thought. Reeves surveys the history of the movement (with an excellent appendix on Joachimistic literature, pp. 511–46) and argues that its optimistic attitude toward history links medieval historiography with the Renaissance sense of the past. É. Gebhart, *Mystics and Heretics in Italy at the End of the Middle Ages*, focuses on Franciscan movements prior to Dante. Albert C. Shannon, *The Popes and Heresy in the Thirteenth Century*, centers on the papal reaction to the Albigensian heresy in southern France and on heretical movements in Italy.

Mysticism

A convenient collection of the chief mystic writings is R. Petry, ed., *Late Medieval Mysticism*, in the Library of Christian Classics series. Wilhelm Totok, *Handbuch der Geschichte der Philosophie* (vol. 2, pp. 213–31), gives a detailed bibliography.

William R. Inge, *Christian Mysticism*, presents enthusiastic comments by a British scholar about the role of mysticism in religion. He emphasizes the ancient period and the neo-Platonic tradition. See especially chapter 1, "The General Characteristics of Mysticism." K. E. Kirk, *The Vision of God: The Christian Doctrine of the Summum Bonum*, focuses on the ethical implications of mysticism.

Other works deal with mysticism on a regional basis. David Knowles, *The English Mystical Tradition*, is one of the best. Chapters 1 and 2 summarize the general character and evolution of Christian mysticism, emphasizing the medieval development of two traditions: the Augustinian, which emphasized mystical asceticism as a means for gaining enlightenment in understanding not only God but the world, and a neo-Platonic ecstatic, self-transcending tradition. Knowles then